



MINUTES OF CONSUMER ADVISORY PANEL MEETING		
Date	23 September 2021	
Time:	09:30	
Venue:	Microsoft Teams	
Remotely	Mariza Jurgens	MJ
	Fanie Swanepoel	FS
	Ishmael Hlomane	IH
	Jeremiah Sikhosana	JS
	Rajesh Jock	RJ
	Pretty Dibakoane	PD
	Sibabalwe Mqhayi	SM
	Aifheli Makhwanya	AM
	Dylan Thomas	DT
Joining 12:00 noon	Zanyiwe Asare	ZA
By Invitation	Gumani Malebusha	Acting Senior Manager: Consumer Affairs
	Lerato Morobane	Regions and Consumer Affairs
	Cllr L Mkumatela	Councillor
	Cllr T Semane	Councillor
	Champs Maine	Manager: Finance

Independent Communications Authority of South Africa

No.	Minute	Action
1.	<p>Opening and Welcome</p> <p>a. As there was the CAP Chairperson position was vacant, Cllr Mkumatela opened the meeting at 09:00am and welcomed Consumer Advisory Panel Members and other invitees. Following a brief discussion on a point of order regarding the best option to proceed, it was resolved that CAP members should select amongst themselves a chairperson for the day.</p> <p>b. IH was unanimously selected to be chairperson for the day.</p>	
2.	<p>Apologies</p> <p>It was reported that ZA would be joining the meeting at 12:00pm after a doctor's appointment.</p> <p>Confirmation of Quorum</p>	



No.	Minute	Action
	A quorum being present, the meeting was duly constituted.	
3.	Ratification of agenda RJ moved FS seconded	RJ and FS
4.	Declaration of conflict Interest There was no conflict of interest recorded by any member regarding items on the meeting agenda.	
5.	Actionable Items/ Matters arising from previous minutes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> JS informed the meeting that he had not received input from team champions the Preliminary Quarterly Draft Advisory report as agreed in the previous meeting. The chairperson kindly requested the relevant champions to assist with input. 	Champions
6.	Ratification of agenda RJ moved and FS seconded	
7.	Council Feedback and Governance Issues In presenting CAP Q1 Council feedback to the meeting, JS referred to SM's Q1 Report which had been circulated to CAP members prior to the meeting. JS indicated the Q1 CAP report was approved after several questions of clarity by Council members. JS remarked on the improvement of the standard of engagement by Cllrs, which he felt was motivational to the work of CAP.	JS
8.	Liaison Officer's role: CAP Stakeholder Engagements <p>a. GM informed the meeting about a special request raised by ICASA Liaison Officers on the role and expectations of CAP regarding its work of stakeholder engagement and consumer advocacy. This issue was raised against the background of the forthcoming stakeholder engagement in North West Province.</p> <p>b. IH requested Liaison Officers to introduce themselves and the following Officers introduced themselves:</p> <p>Winnie Tlale: North West, James Ngoma: Gauteng, Mpho Moletsane PE, Mavhungu Makatu: Limpopo, David Thabethe: Mpumalanga, Moruakgomo Louw: Northern Cape and Xolile Mateza: Western Cape</p> <p>c. IH indicated that, CAP is an advisory panel to ICASA reporting to Council through Councillor Mkumatela and Semane and is assisted</p>	<p>GM</p> <p>IH</p>



No.	Minute	Action
	<p>operationally by Consumer Affairs. IH went to state that as CAP is assisted by CCA on operational and administrative support, the expectation from CAP is that when they visit the provinces, they are to be guided and supported by regional teams for technical support with respect to handling operational issues that may be raised by stakeholders.</p> <p>d. JS concurred with IS on his explanation and articulation of the nature of support and assistance requested by CAP when conducting stakeholder engagements in the regions.</p> <p>e. MJ enquired from the Regional Managers about their level of engagement with Persons with disabilities and other vulnerable groups.</p> <p>f. WT advised that on the upcoming CAP event at Christiana, there are no Traditional Leadership, and proposed that the visit for Traditional Leaders be held in Taung.</p> <p>g. MM advised that perhaps there should be a debriefing feedback for CAP members and the regional team after the engagement. In responding Mariza's question, he indicated that their engagement with Persons with Disability is done mostly during November/December.</p> <p>h. GM indicated that what was critical on the issue of engaging with the regions, was the sharing of the execution plan on time to enable Liaison Officers to plan accordingly.</p> <p>i. IH thanked the regional teams and Gumani for highlighting issues to CAP member and indicated that we are working to serve the same objectives on Stakeholder engagements.</p> <p>j. Cllr Mkumatela indicated that CAP is a special vehicle that is supposed to convey consumers challenges to ICASA Council on what they have discovered.</p>	<p>Stakeholder Champions</p> <p>Stakeholder Champions</p> <p>GM</p> <p>IH</p> <p>Cllr Mkumatela</p>
9.	<p>CAP Performance Review</p> <p>JS remarked that we needed to know what had been done during the quarter, so that we are clear as to what to present to Council.</p> <p>9.1 Stakeholder Engagements and Consumer Advocacy</p> <p>a. SM update on the Eastern Cape: The vast area of the Eastern Cape</p>	<p>JS</p> <p>Stakeholder Champions</p>



No.	Minute	Action
	<p>province was covered during the stakeholder engagement. The engagement included gathering critical consumer concerns from community traditional leaders, SMME's, community radio stations, the youth and person with disabilities. In Mdantsane, a school for children with physical disabilities was visited; in King Williams Town, a school for the hearing impaired and centre for virtually impaired persons was visited.</p> <p>b. Also visited were SMME's who run business who complained about internet and phone connectivity challenges.</p> <p>c. DT commented on how bad connection the internet and radio access reception from the airport and recommended that there was a need to focus more on assisting the community of the Eastern Cape with connectivity/access.</p> <p>d. IH commented that they couldn't access one of the post offices, the branch manager was sceptical to engage with us. We engaged informally with consumers to understand their experiences with network coverage. We also observe coverage on the national routes to cater for accident and network.</p> <p>e. JS commented that it would help in terms of reporting on the issue of negative economic impact, and we could advise Council on how youth unemployment could be alleviated with access to ICT skills in the rural areas.</p> <p>f. IH commented that they would need to creatively craft a meaningful advisory report to capture what they gathered. The Eastern Cape Engagements went off well as Sibabalwe went all out with the help of regional team to get the quality audience who gave us the real issues. Socio economic that we see out there we need to have it as a focus.</p> <p>g. Cllr Mkumatela commented that CAP must have access to premises that, engage through ICASA and responsible Division.</p> <p>h. IH further commented that a lot of pertinent issues were picked up from traditional leaders, consumers, and post office. A letter was drafted to CCA, and Gumani would provide feedback on that.</p> <p>i. GM responded that a discussion was required on that, they had not received any feedback from the regional office. Gumani advised members to be clear in view of the timelines in the operational</p>	<p>DT</p> <p>IH</p> <p>JS</p> <p>IH</p> <p>Cllr Mkumatela</p> <p>Stakeholder Champions</p> <p>GM</p>

No.	Minute	Action
	<p>plan of head office and regional offices.</p> <p>9.2 Consumer protection research areas identified</p> <p>a. AM commented that the concept document complaints mechanism feedback received in June 2021 meeting was to be included in the agreed deliverable that will be tabled in Q4.</p> <p>b. JS indicated that CAP is expected to report one area identified for consumer protection research by the end of September 2021. The concept document prepared by AM on complaints mechanism review looks the same as the one that had been presented as the identified consumer research. According to JS, there was still nothing to report for research area identification in Q3 and this must be rectified.</p> <p>c. MJ reminded JS that the benchmarking report is part of research, the trends report, and the planned complaints report in December 2021. The research teamwork is working in accordance with the APP.</p> <p>d. IH requested clarification on what then would be reported at the end of September 2021 as an identified research area for consumer protection.</p> <p>e. JS clarified that the identified research area indicator in CAP's work plan is different to the performance indicator on consumer complaints mechanism review. The issue of benchmarking and consumer trends report are listed separately in our work plan.</p> <p>f. AM agreed with JS and proposed that the research champions regroup and have discussions on how to cover the gap on the target.</p> <p>g. AM requested the research team to submit by 27 September 2021, Aifheli volunteered to take the responsibility</p> <p>9.3 Commentary on Regulations</p> <p>a. AM indicated that there was no deliverable due for this quarter (Q2).</p> <p>b. MJ indicated that the release of COVID 19 Regulations report focusing on Persons with Disabilities was happening that day. The report was released by the Human Science Rights Council. She</p>	<p></p> <p>AM</p> <p>Research Champions</p> <p>Research Champions</p> <p>AM</p> <p>AM</p> <p>MJ</p>

No.	Minute	Action
	<p>committed to draft a report on concerns to be submitted to Council. MJ proposed that members should wait for HSRC report prior submission to Council.</p> <p>c. FS commented was that COVID 19 survey circulated to all as well as Individuals with Disabilities Organisations only few people responded, Fanie will look for the report and circulate to CAP members.</p> <p>d. JS proposed that for the quarter, CAP should submit critical concerns to Council without MJ input and that would give MJ adequate time to her input for the next quarter (Q3).</p> <p>9.4 Critical Concerns (emanating from different projects)</p> <p>a. SM commented on the effectiveness of RICA as a research project as this matter came up in Eastern Cape engagement with the communities visited. Crime persists on sim cards registration which poses fraud and identity theft risks. RICA issues identified as research area because it results in crime prevention in most communities.</p> <p>b. DT was requested to provide source of report on internet access, how it impacts on schools, jobs, and small businesses in the rural areas.</p> <p>c. Cllr Mkumatela indicated posed a question on to what extent CAP members understand the degree of literacy level in a digital environment in the country.</p> <p>d. JS responded that the issue of digital literacy was of critical importance as it linked to the availability of economic opportunity, it could indeed be a suitable area of research that could be identified by CAP members.</p> <p>e. IH commented that one of the issues is licence obligations of mobile operators who do not provide tools for school's connectivity.</p> <p>f. AM committed to provide a report on digital literacy.</p> <p>g. RJ suggested the issue of poor service quality by telecommunication operators: dropped calls and signal problems. He enquired if ICASA monitored that.</p>	<p></p> <p>FS</p> <p>All</p> <p>Research Champions</p> <p>DT</p> <p>JS</p> <p>IH</p> <p>AM</p> <p>RJ</p>

No.	Minute	Action
	<p>h. GM responded on the issue of quality of service and indicated that an experienced Engineering team is responsible for conducting these measurements, and that there are standard of measurements on the Regulations that are given to licensees.</p> <p>i. RJ proposed that CAP members should have a presentation from the responsible division.</p> <p>j. GM proposed that, the next meeting Engineering Division should be invited for a presentation on quality of service.</p> <p>9.5 Collaborations with Relevant Bodies Identified</p> <p>a. JS indicated that the report was circulated and these recommendations flow from CAP reports and activities. MJ and JS had recommended the CSIR and SABS as they play a key role in terms of implementing internet accessibility standards in the country</p> <p>b. MJ agreed with JS and indicated it was indeed quite clear on what the report was proposing.</p> <p>c. DT commented that he had read the report and was pleased.</p> <p>d. IH indicated that the report is what had been agreed upon.</p> <p>9.6 Proposals on Effectiveness of Complaints Mechanism</p> <p>a. AM indicated that, there was no update on this item in June 2021 which members approved the concept document with slight amendments.</p> <p>b. JS informed the meeting that during Council meeting a question was asked about the rationale of reviewing the CCC in the complaint's mechanism. He had responded that CAP would like to look at the overall effectiveness of complaints mechanism.</p> <p>c. GM needed to understand how consumers get to be satisfied after CCC had made a recommendation, of which Council itself would have sanctioned the findings of the CCC? What remedies is CAP having in mind regarding the satisfaction of consumers about the CCC findings?</p> <p>d. AM responded that she noted what Gumani was getting to and requested to be given a chance to clarify that with research</p>	<p>GM</p> <p>RJ</p> <p>Secretariat</p> <p>JS</p> <p>CAP Members</p> <p>AM</p> <p>JS</p> <p>GM</p> <p>AM</p>



No.	Minute	Action
	<p>champions and to deliberate on concept document regarding the matter and would report back.</p> <p>e. Resolution: It was agreed that Research Champions will submit the concept document on 30 September 2021.</p> <p>9.7 Benchmarking</p> <p>a. SM indicated that the purpose of this project was to benchmark the ICASA's performance and standard websites to cater for vulnerable groups and other African Countries. These were benchmarked against the UK Regulatory and Australia as the best-of-breed entities.</p> <p>9.8 Assessment Conducted on Consumer Trends</p> <p>a. DT indicated that he had submitted comments which were incorporated with Q2 report and other analysis are reserved for the next meeting.</p> <p>9.9 Planning and Reporting</p> <p>a. JS flagged the identification of the consumer research area as outstanding and that the critical consumer concerns required additional work.</p> <p>b. IH requested members to agree on what was required with regards to advisory report for quarterly.</p> <p>c. It was agreed that CAP members submit inputs to JS on 27 September 2021 for Q2 report.</p>	<p>Research Team</p> <p>SM</p> <p>DT</p> <p>JS</p> <p>IH</p> <p>Research Champions</p>
10	<p>Finance Report</p> <p>a. CM indicated that they were going to be improvements from then onwards regarding report back on CAP budget expenditure.</p> <p>b. It was pointed out that the Staff costs contained an error in terms of budget line and is to be corrected.</p> <p>c. It's a positive in terms of where we are now it will be informed of your activities for the year.</p> <p>d. JS asked about the cut-off times for including previous events/engagements that had happened two weeks ago.</p> <p>e. CM responded that Finance usually waits for the calendar month to</p>	<p>CM</p> <p>JS</p> <p>CM</p>



No.	Minute	Action
	<p>finish and then wait for seven days following the event.</p> <p>f. IH recognised Mr Maine for presenting CAP expenditure report to members.</p>	IH
11	<p>General/critical concerns</p> <p>a. Cllr Mkumatela wanted to know how they could assist CAP members with advance allowance when travelling. Cllr Mkumatela proposed that the matter should be escalated to the CFO, CEO or Council for CAP to execute their duties.</p> <p>b. Cllr Semane agree with Cllr Mkumatela, she added that Council was not aware of the issues of CAP members about traveling challenges.</p> <p>c. GM proposed that, issues be directed to the CFO and would invite both Executives and the CFO. CAP members are requested to list the issues to be addressed.</p> <p>d. The meeting was informed that the APP meeting was scheduled for 6 and 7 October 2021, Mr David Molapo from office of the CEO will assist with facilitating the APP meeting.</p>	<p>Cllr Mkumatela</p> <p>Cllr Semane</p> <p>GM</p>
12	<p>Dates of meetings 2021/2022</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Q1: 24 June 2021 • Q2: 23 September 2021 • Q3: 2 December 2021 • Q4: Before 23 March 2022 	Chairperson
13	<p>Meeting adjourned at 16:57pm</p> <p>Date of next meeting: Q3 2 December 2021</p>	Chairperson

Signed:

Ishmael Hlomane (Mr)
Chairperson for the Day

Date: 2 December 2021